Healthcare Burnout in Minnesota

National Rural Health Resource Center
SRHT HELP Webinar
December 13, 2017

Rahul Koranne, MD, MBA, FACP
Agenda

- Environment
- Background
- Process
- Our Journey
- Discussion
World Happiness Report

- Measure of Happiness published by the UN Sustainable Development Solutions Network
- 4/2/12 “Happiness and Wellbeing: Defining a new Economic Paradigm” chaired by Bhutan (Gross National Happiness)

- **Gallup World Poll** - since 2005, 160 countries, 100 global questions - 1000 individuals per country, non-institutionalized >15 years old, in own language
Figure 7.1. US Happiness Score, 2006-2016

Source: Gallup International Cantril ladder
Table 5.2. How Adult Life Satisfaction is Predicted by Adult Outcomes (Partial correlation coefficients)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>USA</th>
<th>Australia</th>
<th>Britain BCS</th>
<th>Britain BHPS</th>
<th>Indonesia</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Income (log)</td>
<td>0.16 (.00)</td>
<td>0.09 (.01)</td>
<td>0.08 (.01)</td>
<td>0.09 (.01)</td>
<td>0.18 (.03)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Years of education</td>
<td>0.05 (.01)</td>
<td>-0.03 (.01)</td>
<td>0.03 (.01)</td>
<td>0.02 (.00)</td>
<td>0.05 (.01)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not unemployed</td>
<td>0.05 (.00)</td>
<td>0.04 (.01)</td>
<td>0.03 (.01)</td>
<td>0.06 (.00)</td>
<td>0.02 (.01)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Partnered</td>
<td>0.34 (.01)</td>
<td>0.14 (.01)</td>
<td>0.21 (.01)</td>
<td>0.11 (.00)</td>
<td>0.04 (.01)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physical illness</td>
<td>-0.20 (.00)</td>
<td>-0.17 (.01)</td>
<td>-0.06 (.01)</td>
<td>-0.11 (.00)</td>
<td>-0.07 (.01)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mental illness</td>
<td>-0.21 (.00)</td>
<td>-0.18 (.01)</td>
<td>-0.11 (.01)</td>
<td>-0.32 (.00)</td>
<td>-0.07 (.01)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>0.08 (.00)</td>
<td>0.08 (.01)</td>
<td>0.11 (.02)</td>
<td>0.05 (.00)</td>
<td>0.07 (.01)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>268,300</td>
<td>16,001</td>
<td>17,812</td>
<td>139,507</td>
<td>31,437</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Neuroscience of Happiness

• Sustained positive emotion
• Recovery from negative emotion (Resiliency)
• Pro-social behavior and generosity
• Mindfulness
Figure 5.1: Psychological well-being is predicted by sustained activation of the ventral striatum across trials in response to positive pictures, p<.005, corrected for multiple comparisons. Modified from Heller et al. (2013).
Harvard Happiness Study

• Study being done since 1938
• Closely tracked and analyzed 700 subjects
• Main conclusion that *warmth of relationships throughout life have the greatest impact on life satisfaction* (family, friends, community)
• Potential actions:
  • Replace screen time with people time
  • Take relationships from stale to novelty
  • Resolve relationship feuds
US Employees

• Third annual Work Stress Survey in 2013 showed 83% were stressed at work (up 10% from year before)
• 2015 Gallup survey of 81,000 employees showed 50% not engaged and 17% actively disengaged
Quadruple Aim

- Experience of Care
- Caring for Healthcare Staff
- Population Health
- Per Capita Cost
Pharmacists

  • 823 pharmacists surveyed, 46% response rate
  • 49% of respondents facing high risk of burnout

• Pharmacists attitude towards work life: 2004 survey of 1737 pharmacists in WI
  • 68% experienced job stress and role overload
  • 48% had work-home conflict
  • Stress higher in chain and hospital settings
• Health Affairs 2011 study on nurse burnout examined survey data from 95,499 nurses supported by AHRQ
  • 34% of hospital nurses and 37% of nursing home nurses reported burnout
  • Correlation between % of patients who would definitely recommend and nurse dissatisfaction
• Many more studies around the world showing burnout and dissatisfaction
Mental Health Providers

• 1999 study of 151 community mental health workers in CA found 54% had high emotional exhaustion
• 2005 study of 751 state chapter of Social Workers showed 36% had high emotional exhaustion
• 2007 study of 71 forensic mental health workers showed 54% reported high rates of emotional exhaustion
Face of Burn Out

Emotional Exhaustion

Detachment & Cynicism

Low Sense of Personal accomplishment

Sense of Ineffectiveness
Physicians and APPs

- National studies like Medscape and Mayo Clinic burnout analysis showed increasing prevalence burnout in physicians with rates around 54% in 2016
Consequences

I Don’t Care
It’s not my job

NO!

MY DOCTOR SHOT HIMSELF
I MISS HIM
Consequences

Patient Care

Costs

Human Toll
I never guess. It is a capital mistake to theorize before one has data. Insensibly one begins to twist facts to suit theories, instead of theories to suit facts.
Continuous Improvement Model
Dr. Mark Linzer

Hennepin County Medical Center
Hot Spotting
Redesigning Spaces

Reset Room

Wellness Center
Plan

- Expand this model on a **statewide** scale
- Be **data driven** and led
- Identify **hot spots and best practices** through data
- **Collaborate** to **learn together** and **spread** demonstrated practices that work
Guiding Coalition
• Each site’s individual data & statewide comparison performed and shared
• Organizations share/discuss data
• Identify top priority domains
• Act by trial and error statewide
  • Wellness Committee and Champions
  • Workflow redesign
  • Social gatherings
  • Redesign spaces
  • Power of communication
Check and Adjust

• **Check** which actions show movement in data
• **Spread** those strategies and actions that show demonstrable positive movement through data
• **Continuously adjust actions** based upon data
A gemba visit
All of the Information

What you really need to know
CXO Survey: Driver Selection

- Control: 95%
- Meaningful work: 86%
- Values alignment: 71%
- Recognition: 57%
- Fairness: 57%
- High quality care: 48%
- Financial rewards: 43%
- Social connections: 43%
Survey Composition
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>2016</th>
<th>2017</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sites/Systems</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Individual Hospitals</td>
<td>104</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number Surveyed</td>
<td>13,693</td>
<td>19,350</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Response Rate</td>
<td>43%</td>
<td>29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of Respondents</td>
<td>5,932</td>
<td>5,631</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
What We See

1) It could be worse.
3) Three little letters: E M R.
4) It’s not about the money, but clinicians care about time, control, resources.
General Population: 2014

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Emotional Exhaustion</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Depersonalization</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Burned Out</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Physicians: 2011

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Emotional Exhaustion</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Depersonalization</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Burned Out</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Physicians: 2014

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Emotional Exhaustion</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Depersonalization</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Burned Out</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Minnesota Physicians & APPs: 2017

Emotional Exhaustion
- US General (2011): 23%
- US Physicians (2011): 32%
- MN Physicians & APPs (2017): 43%

Depersonalization
- US General (2011): 15%
- US Physicians (2011): 19%
- US Physicians (2014): 14%
- MN Physicians & APPs (2017): 23%

Burned Out
- US General (2011): 28%
- US Physicians (2011): 38%
- US General (2014): 28%
- MN Physicians & APPs (2017): 49%
Thriving Factors

- Work-life balance: 65
- Meaningful work: 52
- High quality care: 44
- Control: 41
- Financial rewards: 24
- Values alignment: 16
- Fairness: 14
- Recognition: 12
- Meaningful metrics: 12
- Social connections: 8
Satisfied with Current Job

- Strongly agree: 25 (2016) vs. 24 (2017)
- Neither agree nor disagree: 10 (2016) vs. 12 (2017)
- Disagree: 9 (2016) vs. 10 (2017)
- Strongly disagree: 2 (2016) vs. 2 (2017)
Feel Great Stress

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Response</th>
<th>2016</th>
<th>2017</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Strongly agree</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neither agree nor disagree</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disagree</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly disagree</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Amount of Time on EMR
Enough Time for What’s Important

- Strongly disagree: 11%
- Disagree: 25%
- Hard to decide: 22%
- Agree: 36%
- Strongly agree: 42%
Control How I Work

- Strongly disagree: 9
- Disagree: 21
- Hard to decide: 20
- Agree: 41
- Strongly agree: 9

30% Strongly disagree
50% Agree
Resources Allocated Fairly

- Strongly disagree: 8
- Disagree: 20
- Hard to decide: 26
- Agree: 39
- Strongly agree: 6

28% Strongly disagree
45% Agree
Clinician Type

% of respondents: I feel burned out from my work (once a week, a few times a week, every day).
% of respondents: I feel burned out from my work (once a week, a few times a week, every day).
% of respondents: I feel burned out from my work (once a week, a few times a week, every day).
% of respondents: I feel burned out from my work (once a week, a few times a week, every day).

EE x Employed/Independent

33.4

Employed

33.4

Independent
EE x Gender x Clinician Type

% of respondents: I feel burned out from my work (once a week, a few times a week, every day).
So... is it working?
All graphs from this point on display percents.

National Comparisons

Bar chart showing national comparisons for Emotional Exhaustion, Depersonalization, and Burned Out across different groups and years.
Statewide Collaborative Action
Summary

- Clinician burnout an escalating issue with broad consequences
- Data driven improvement process across MN
- Work-life balance, EMR, control & resources biggest drivers of burnout
- System wide and workflow interventions key
Questions & reflections?